

International Journal of Plant & Soil Science

34(22): 1712-1722, 2022; Article no.IJPSS.91941 ISSN: 2320-7035

Biometrical Approach for the Selection of Elite Crosses Combination in Wheat (*Triticum aestivum L.*)

Bijendra Kumar^{a*}, Sarvendra Kumar^a and Som Veer Singh^a

^a Department of Genetics and Plant Breeding, Chandra Shekhar Azad University of Agriculture and Technology (UP)-208002, India.

Authors' contributions

This work was carried out in collaboration among all authors. All authors read and approved the final manuscript.

Article Information

DOI: 10.9734/IJPSS/2022/v34i2231551

Open Peer Review History:

This journal follows the Advanced Open Peer Review policy. Identity of the Reviewers, Editor(s) and additional Reviewers, peer review comments, different versions of the manuscript, comments of the editors, etc are available here: https://www.sdiarticle5.com/review-history/91941

Original Research Article

Received 06 July 2022 Accepted 12 September 2022 Published 14 September 2022

ABSTRACT

This experiment has been conducted based on the biometrical technique (half diallel) suitable for making possible combination with different genotypes based on their sowing pattern like timely sown, late sown, timely sown with irrigated and late sown with rainfed condition with genotypes for present investigation comprised of forty five F_1 s developed by crossing 10 lines *viz.*, DBW187, K1601, HD2967, HD3249, DBW321, K1317 K0307, HI 1563, DBW107 and HD3059 following half diallel mating design. The cross combination HD2967X K0307 and K0307X K1601 with the cross HD2967X K0307 with positive and significant values was in the order of merit for grain yield per plant.

Keywords: Biometrical technique; wheat; genotypes; heterosis and sowing time with condition.

1. INTRODUCTION

"Wheat (*Triticum aestivum* L., 2n=42) is the most important cereal in the world and was one of the first crops to be domesticated some 10000 years ago" [1]. It is the most important staple food of about two billions people (36% of the world population). Worldwide, wheat provides nearly 55% of the carbohydrates and 20% of food calories consumed globally. "*T. aestivum* is a segmental allohexaploid (2n = 6x = 42, AABBDD) originated in the Fertile Crescent area of South-Western Asia" [2]. "Wheat is grown on around 221.24 million hectares worldwide, with a

*Corresponding author: E-mail: bijendra.18903@lpu.co.in;

record vield of 771.64 million tonnes of grain and productivity is 3.49 metric tons per hectare" [3]. "India has the most wheat-growing land (14 percent), followed by Russia (12.43 percent), China (11.14 percent), and the United States (6.90 percent), accounting for around 45 percent of the global total. Global wheat production in 2022 is predicted to decline from the 2021 record level by 0.8 per cent, reaching 771.64 million tonnes and marking the first drop in four years. Year-on-year falls in production in Australia, India, Morocco and Ukraine will likely outweigh expected increases in Canada, Iran and Russia Further; it said that in Asia, wheat production in India is forecast at 105.5 million tonnes, down nearly 4 per cent from the record crop gathered in 2021". (Business Standard 2022-23). "Wheat production in 2022-23 is expected to be between 98 million and 106 million tonnes, down from 107.9 million tonnes in 2020-21" [3]. Wheat demand is anticipated to rise by 50% by 2050 compared to current levels.

The success of our wheat varieties is up to a considerable extent due to incorporation of the Norin 10 genes i.e. Rhtl and Rht2 in wheat. These dwarfing genes changed the wheat plants type and it becomes more responsive to higher application of fertilizer and better crop management under practices. In 1966, Dr. N.E. Borlaug, a noble laureate introduced the Mexican dwarf wheat genotypes and provides the way for green revolution in India.

2. MATERIALS AND METHODS

The present investigation was conducted at Oil Seed Farm, Kalyanpur, C.S. Azad University of Agriculture and Technology, Kanpur-208002 (U.P.) during *Rabi*, 2021-22. The experimental material for present investigation comprised of forty five F₁s developed by crossing 10 lines *viz.*, DBW187, K1601, HD2967, HD3249, DBW321, K1317 K0307, HI 1563, DBW107 and HD3059 following half diallel mating design. A total of 100 treatments with 10 parents (45 F₁s and 45 F₂s) were evaluated for the study of twelve quantitative characters in wheat.

2.1 Satistical and Biometrical Techniques

2.1.1 Diallel analysis

2.1.1.1 Testing the validity of the hypothesis

To test the validity of the hypothesis, i.e., the assumptions regarding diallel analysis as

proposed by Hayman [4], such as (i) diploid segregation (ii) no maternal effect, (iii) no linkage (iv) no multiple allelism, (v) independent action of non-allelic genes and (vi) hemozygosity of parents, the t^2 test was applied as suggested by Hayman [4]:

t^2 = (n-2)/4 [(Var Vr – Var Wr)² / Var Vr x Var Wr) – Cov² (Vr, Wr)]

which is an F test with 4 and (n-2) degree of freedom.

A significant value of t^2 would indicate the nonuniformity of Wr, Vr and thus, invalidates the hypothesis postulated. The failure of hypothesis is also indicated by non- significant regression coefficient.

$$b = \frac{Cov (Wr, Vr)}{Var (Vr)}$$

Where,

Cov. (Wr, Vr) =
$$\left[\sum VrWr - \frac{\sum Vr\sum Wr}{n}\right] / (n-1)$$
 and
Var (Vr) = $\left[\sum Vr^2 - \frac{(\sum Vr)^2}{n}\right] / (n-1)$

The standard error of regression coefficient (b) was calculated as:

Where,

N = number of parents

Now the significance of differences 'b' from zero and unity was tested by using 't' value of (b-0)/SE (b) and (1-b)/SE (b) with (n-2) degree of freedom.

(i) Variance component analysis:

The components of variance in diallel cross were computed in F_1 by the use of equation given by Hayman [4].

Expectation for F₁ diallel crosses is as follows:

$$Vp = \widehat{D} + \widehat{E}$$

$$Vr = (1/_4)\widehat{D} + (1/_4)\widehat{H}_1 - (1/_4)\widehat{F} + [(n+1)/2n]\widehat{E}$$

$$Wr = (1/_2)\widehat{D} - (1/_4)\widehat{F} + (1/n)\widehat{E}$$

$$Vm = (1/_4)\widehat{D} + (1/_4)\widehat{H}_1 - (1/_4)\widehat{H}_2 - (1/_4)\widehat{F} + ij = 1$$

(1/2 n) \widehat{E} k =

Jinks [5] and Hayman [6] gave expectations for F_2 diallel crosses. The expected statistics for F_2 generation are the same of that of F_1 except the contribution of h which is halved by one generation of inbreeding. Hence, the coefficient of H_1 and H_2 are (1/4) of those F_1 statistics while the coefficient of F is halved being second and first degree statistics h^2 , respectively [5, 6,7].

(ii). Combining ability analysis:

The combining ability analysis was worked out by the procedure suggested by Griffings [8] Method 2. Model II. The mathematical model for the combining ability analysis is assumed to be:

$$X_{ijkl} = \mu + g_i + g_j + S_{ij} + e/bc \sum_{k} e_{ijkl}$$

ij = 1,2, 3,n; k = 1,2,3, b; 1= 1,2, 3....,c.

Where,

 X_{ijkl} = The mean of ijth genotype over k and l. μ = The population mean

gi = The general combining ability (gca) of the ith patent

 $g_j = The gca of j^{th} parent$

 S_{ij} = The specific combining ability (sca) for the cross between ith and Jth parents such that S_{ij} = S_{ji} e_{ijkl} = The environmental effect (mean error effect) with the ijklth observation on ith individual in kth block with ith as femal parent and jthas male parent.

The usual restrictions, as $\sum_i gi = 0$, and $\sum_j S_{ij} = S_{ij} = 0$ (for each i) are imposed.

The analysis of variance table for combining ability is as follows:

Source variation	d.f.	S.S.	M.S.	'F' test
Gca	(n-1)	Sg	Mg	Mg/Me for (n-1), m d.f.
Sca	n(n-1)/2	Ss	Ms	Ms/Me for (n-1)/2, m. d.f.
Error	Μ	Se	Me	

Where,

Sg = 1/n+2 [$\sum (x_i + x_{ii})^2 - (4/n) x \dots^2$] Ss = $\sum_i \sum_i x_{ii}^2 - 1/(n+2) \sum (x_1 + x_{ii})^2 + [2/(n+1) (n+2)]x \dots^2$

 $M_{e1} = M_e/r$

Where,

 $\begin{array}{l} r = \text{Number of replications} \\ \text{Me} = \text{The error M.S. obtained from parents} + F_1 \text{s and Parents} + F_2 \text{s} \\ S_g = \text{The sum of squares (S.S) due to gca} \\ S_s = \text{The sum of squares due to sca} \\ n = \text{Number of parents} \\ x_{\cdot \cdot} = \text{The grand total} \\ x_i = \text{Total of the array involving i}^{\text{th}} \text{ as a female parent} \\ x_{ij} = \text{Value of the i}^{\text{th}} \text{ parent of the array} \\ x_{ij} = \text{The value of the cross, with i}^{\text{th}} \text{ as a female parent and j}^{\text{th}} \text{ as a male parent} \end{array}$

The components of variance were estimated according to (Singh, 1990) as under:

gca expected m.s. = $\sigma^2 + (n+2)/(n-1)\sum_{j}g_i^2$ sca expected m.s. = $\sigma^2 + 2/n(n-1)\sum_{i}\sum_{j}s_{ij}^2$ The general predictability ration (GPR) was computed as:

GPR = $2\sigma^2$ gca / $2\sigma^2$ gca + σ^2 sca

Average degree of dominance = $(\sigma^2 s / \sigma^2 g)^{0.5}$

Estimates of various effects:

The Various effects were estimated as follows:

gca effect of ith parent (g_i) = $1/(n+2) [(x_i+x_{ij}) -$ (2/n) x..)

sca effect of ijth cross (S_{ii}) $= x_{ii} - 1/(n+2)$ $[x_i+x_{ii}+x_i+x_{ii})+2x./(n+1)(n+2)]$

Where.

gi and S_{ii} = the estimates of the general and specific combining ability effect, respectively, $x_i, x_{ii}, x...x_{ij}$ = the same as explained earlier, x_{i} = total of the arrays involving jth parents as a male and

 x_{ii} = the value of the jth parent of the array.

Estimation of standard errors:

SE (gi) = $[(n-1) \sigma^2 e/n (n+2)]^{0.5}$ SE (gi-gj) = $[2 \sigma^2 e/(n+2)]^{0.5}$ SE (S_{ii}) = $[(n^2 + n + 2) \sigma^2 e/(n+1) (n+2)]^{0.5}$ SE $(S_{ii} - S_{ik}) = [2(n+1) \sigma^2 e / (n+2)]^{0.5}$

Where,

 $\sigma^2 e = Me/r$, taken as error MS from the combining ability analysis.

Estimation of Heterosis:

Heterosis: The nature and magnitude of heterosis was computed as per cent increase or decrease of the mean value of F1 over mid parent (MP), better parent (BP) and economic parents/standard variety/check (check), was estimated with the help of following formula:

Heterosis (%) over MP $= (\overline{F}_{1} - \overline{MP} / \overline{MP}) \times$ 100

Where,

 \overline{F}_1 = mean of the F_1

 \overline{MP} = Mean of the mid parent

Heterosis (%) over BP $(\overline{F}_1 - \overline{BP} / \overline{BP}) \times 100$ _

Where.

 \overline{F}_1 = mean of the F_1 \overline{BP} = Mean of the better parent

Heterosis (%) over Check = $(\overline{F}_1 - \overline{Check} / \overline{BCheck}) \times 100$

Where,

 \overline{F}_1 = mean of the F_1

 \overline{check} = Mean of the check/economic parent

Test of significance: Significance of heterosis over better parents was tested as;

CD = SE x 't' ('t' value at 5% and 1%)

Where,

 Me_2 = Error variation obtained from parents + F_{1s} ANNOVA R = Number of replications

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

3.1 Combining Ability In Relation To Yield and Quality Attributes

The combining ability analysis provides useful information in the screening of desirable strains and their cross combinations for their utilization. Such knowledge is a pre-requisite in order to frame a systematic breeding programme leading to rapid and sustained improvement.

Highly significant variances due to gca and sca in both the generations of present study for all the traits revealed that additive as well as nonadditive genetic effects were involved in determining the traits. Genetic components analysis also indicated predominance of nonadditive genetic estimate for all the characters. similar results were also been reported by Tiwari and Chakraborty [9], Ahmad et al. [10], Sharma et al. [11], Singh and Rai [12], Kulsherestha et al. [13], Zalewski [14], Kumar et al. [15], Srivastava [16], Rabbani et al., [17], Singh et al. [18], Samier [19] and Kumar [20].

Kumar et al.; IJPSS, 34(22): 1712-1722, 2022; Article no.IJPSS.91941



Fig. 1. ANOVA for combining ability and related statistics of 12 characters in a 10 parent of diallel cross in F1 and F2 generations of wheat



Fig. 2. Estimates of GCA effects and corresponding mean performance of the parents for 12 characters in a 10 parent's diallel cross in F1 and F2 generations of wheat

Table 1. Estimates of specific combining ability effect and corresponding mean performance for 12 attribute in the 45 crosses of F₁ and F₂ generation

	Days to 75% flowering		ys to 75% flowering Plant height (cm)		of productive tillers/pl No. of spikelets/spike			Spike length (cm) No. of grain/s			ain/spike	e Days to maturity		Grain weight (g)		E ar density		Duration of		Protein content (%)		Grain yield/plant (g)		
Characters / Crosses	s so	CA	s	CA	S	CA	s	CA	S	CA	so	A	S	CA	S	CA	s	CA	SC	CA	S	CA	SC	A
	F1	F2	F1	F2	F1	F2	F1	F ₂	F1	F2	F1	F ₂	F1	F2	F1	F2	F1	F2	F1	F ₂	F1	F2	F1	F2
HD3249X DBW187	-1.03 **	-1.64 **	1.19 **	0.80 *	-0.17 **	-0.24 **	-0.22 **	-0.34 **	0.03	-0.03	-2.09 **	-2.27 **	0.90 *	0.81	-0.84 **	-1.05 **	-0.03 *	-0.03	1.93 **	1.84 *	0.46 **	0.42 **	1.03 **	0.98 **
HD3249X HD2967	-2.31 **	-2.92 **	0.73 *	0.34	0.1	0.04	-0.1	-0.22 **	0.18 **	0.11	-1.80 **	-1.98 **	1.90 **	2.72 **	-0.27 *	-0.47 **	-0.04 **	-0.05 **	4.21 **	5.03 **	-0.37 **	-0.42 **	-2.57 **	-2.61 **
HD3249X K0307	-1.06 **	-1.67 **	1.04 **	0.64	-0.83 **	-0.88 **	-0.08	-0.19 *	-0.28 **	-0.33 **	-1.40 **	-1.58 **	0.56	0.47	0.13	-0.09	0.05 **	0.05 **	1.62 **	1.53 *	-0.75 **	-0.80 **	-1.27 **	-1.32 **
HD3249X K1601	0.27	-0.34	-0.07	-0.47	-0.88 **	-0.94 **	-0.13	-0.25 **	0.16 **	0.11	0.52 *	0.33	-1.10 **	-1.19	2.28 **	2.08 **	-0.04 **	-0.05 **	-1.38 **	-1.47	0.05	0	-0.93 **	-0.98 **
HD3249X K1317	0.47	-0.12	-4.21 **	-4.61 **	0.09	0.03	-0.11	-0.26 **	-0.26 **	-0.32 **	-1.04 **	-1.22 **	-1.08 **	-1.17	0.30 **	0.11	0.04 **	0.04 **	-1.54 **	-1.63 *	-0.24 **	-0.29 **	0.24 **	0.20 **
HD3249X H11563	-0.76 *	-1.37 **	-0.98 **	-1.39 **	0.14 **	0.08	0.27 **	0.17 *	0.03	-0.02	1.86 **	1.68 **	1.90 **	2.11 **	0.43 **	0.23	0.02	0.02	2.65 **	2.87 **	-0.58 **	-0.63 **	0.35 **	0.31 **
HD3249X DBW107	-0.37	-0.98 *	0.27	-0.13	0.13 *	0.06	0.19 *	0.06	-0.1	-0.16 **	1.50 **	1.34 **	3.09 **	3.00 **	-1.88 **	-2.08 **	0.04 **	0.04 **	3.46 **	3.37 **	-0.19 **	-0.23 **	-0.27 **	-0.30 **
HD3249X HD3059	2.16 **	1.58 **	0.3	-0.1	0.19 **	0.13 *	0.59 **	0.48 **	0.34 **	0.27 **	-0.01	-0.19	-1.94 **	-2.03 **	-1.12 **	-1.32 **	-0.02	-0.01	-4.10 **	-4.19 **	-0.69 **	-0.73 **	-0.28 **	-0.32 **
HD3249X DBW321	1.52 **	0.91 *	1.82 **	1.41 **	0.30 **	0.23 **	0.43 **	0.34 **	0.16 **	0.1	-0.04	-0.21	-3.30 **	-3.39 **	0.19	0.02	0.01	0.01	-4.82 **	-4.91 **	-0.07 *	-0.12 **	-0.02	-0.06
DBW187X HD2967	-1.23 **	-1.84 **	1.89 **	1.41 **	0.42 **	0.36 **	-0.07	-0.19 *	-0.29 **	-0.36 **	-0.37	-0.55 *	1.59 **	1.53 *	0.26 *	0.06	0.04 **	0.05 **	2.82 **	2.76 **	-0.27 **	-0.32 **	-1.78 **	-1.83 **
DBW187XK0307	0.02	-0.59	1.00 **	0.61	-0.58 **	-0.64 **	-0.12	-0.24 **	-0.18 **	-0.23 **	-0.70 **	-0.88 **	2.26 **	2.28 **	0.36 **	0.31 **	0.02	0.02	2.23 **	2.26 **	-0.67 **	-0.72 **	-1.42 **	-1.47 **
DBW187XK1601	-1.64 **	-2.26 **	-0.44	-0.84 *	-0.62 **	-0.68 **	-0.17 *	-0.29 **	-0.05	-0.1	0.91 **	0.73 **	-1.08 **	-1.06	2.48 **	2.28 **	-0.01	-0.01	0.57	0.59	-0.02	-0.07 *	-0.91 **	-0.96 **
DBW187X K1317	0.22	-0.37	-4.25 **	-4.64 **	-0.02	-0.08	-0.18 *	-0.30 **	-0.03	-0.09	-0.95 **	-1.13 **	-2.05 **	-2.03 **	0.44 **	0.14	-0.01	-0.01	-2.27 **	-2.24 **	-0.20 **	-0.24 **	0.03	-0.02
DBW187X H11563	-0.34	-0.95 *	-1.29 **	-1.68 **	0.17 **	0.1	0.23 **	0.13	0.46 **	0.41 **	1.59 **	1.41 **	-1.08 **	-1.08	0.87 **	0.66 **	-0.07 **	-0.07 **	-0.74	-0.74	-0.32 **	-0.37 **	0.76 **	0.73 **
DBW187X DBW107	0.38	-0.23	0.64 *	0.24	0.29 **	0.24 **	0.15 *	0.02	0.33 **	0.27 **	-0.2	-0.37	1.12 **	1.14	-1.17 **	-1.38 **	-0.05 **	-0.05 **	0.73	0.76	-0.09 **	-0.14 **	-0.08	-0.12 *
DBW187X HD3059	1.58 **	0.99 *	-0.04	-0.44	0.25 **	0.18 **	0.55 **	0.44 **	0.07	0.01	1.89 **	1.71 **	-0.91 *	-0.89	-0.52 **	-0.72 **	0.04 **	0.05 **	-2.49 **	-2.47 **	0.06 *	0.01	0.10 *	0.06
DBW187X DBW321	0.61	-0.01	-0.72 *	-1.12 **	0.42 **	0.36 **	0.46 **	0.39 **	-0.07	-0.14 *	1.99 **	1.82 **	0.73 *	0.75	-0.14	-0.34 **	0.07 **	0.08 **	0.12	0.14	0.05	0	0.30 **	0.26 **
HD2967X K0307	0.41	-0.2	-1.29 **	-1.68 **	-0.24 **	-0.29 **	-0.13	-0.25 **	0.17 **	0.18 **	0.59 **	0.41	0.59	0.53	0.53 **	0.32 **	-0.04 **	-0.05 **	0.18	0.12	-0.35 **	-0.40 **	-0.15 **	-0.19 **
HD2967X K1601	2.41 **	1.80 **	-2.00 **	-2.39 **	-0.28 **	-0.35 **	-0.18 *	-0.30 **	0.04	-0.02	0.69 **	0.51 *	-2.41 **	-2.47 **	1.38 **	1.19 **	-0.02 *	-0.02	-4.82 **	-4.88 **	0.28 **	0.23 **	0.05	0.01
HD2967X K1317	0.94 **	0.36	-2.07 **	-2.47 **	-0.05	-0.12 *	-0.20 **	-0.34 **	-0.04	-0.11	-1.39 **	-1.57 **	-1.05 **	-1.11	0.11	-0.08	-0.01	-0.01	-1.99 **	-2.05 **	0.07 *	0.02	1.19 **	1.29 **
HD2976X H11563	1.72 **	1.11 **	1.09 **	0.7	0.07	0	0.22 **	0.12	0.11 *	0.06	0.84 **	0.67 **	-1.74 **	-1.83 **	0.14	-0.06	0	0	-3.46 **	-3.55 **	-0.05	-0.10 **	2.19 **	2.04 **
HD2967X DBW107	-0.23	-0.84 *	-0.22	-0.61	0.06	-0.01	0.14	0.04	-0.09	-0.15 *	-0.65 **	-0.81 **	-1.88 **	-1.94 **	-1.57 **	-1.77 **	0.03 *	0.03 *	-1.65 **	-1.72 *	0.26 **	0.21 **	1.41 **	1.26 **
HD2967X HD3059	0.63 *	0.05	-1.96 **	-2.36 **	-0.08	-0.15 **	0.53 **	0.43 **	0.02	-0.05	0.91 **	0.73 **	-1.24 **	-1.31	-0.72 **	-0.91 **	0.04 **	0.05 **	-1.88 **	-1.94 *	0.11 **	0.06	1.03 **	1.00 **
HD2967X DBW321	-0.01	-0.62	1.16 **	0.76 *	0.06	-0.01	0.45 **	0.35 **	0.35 **	0.28 **	1.21 **	1.04 **	0.4	0.33	-0.2	-0.40 **	-0.03 **	-0.03 *	0.4	0.34	0.50 **	0.45 **	1.73 **	1.70 **
K0307X K1601	0.66 *	0.05	-1.46 **	-1.86 **	-0.31 **	-0.38 **	-0.59 **	-0.71 **	0.04	-0.16 **	1.09 **	0.91 **	0.92 *	0.94	2.11 **	1.90 **	-0.06 **	-0.04 *	0.26	0.28	0.56 **	0.51 **	-0.35 **	-0.40 **
K0307XK1317	-0.81 *	-1.39 **	-0.23	-0.64	0.65 **	0.58 **	-0.08	-0.22 **	0.16 **	0.11	-0.79 **	-0.97 **	-1.05 **	-1.03	0.37 **	0.17	-0.04 **	-0.04 **	-0.24	-0.22	0.19 **	0.14 **	0.79 **	0.75 **
K0307X H11563	0.97 **	0.36	-2.57 **	-2.97 **	0.40 **	0.33 **	0.34 **	0.24 **	-0.09	-0.22 **	0.31	0.13	-1.08 **	-1.08	-0.60 **	-0.81 **	0.05 **	0.07 **	-2.04 **	-2.05 **	0.07 *	0.02	1.86 **	1.83 **
K0307X DBW107	-1.64 **	-2.26 **	2.62 **	2.22 **	0.63 **	0.55 **	0.13	0	-0.22 **	-0.26 **	-1.18 **	-1.35 **	-1.55 **	-1.53 *	-2.01 **	-2.22 **	0.05 **	0.05 **	0.1	0.12	0.55 **	0.50 **	0.95 **	0.91 **
K0307XHD3059	0.88 **	0.3	-0.33	-0.73 *	0.45 **	0.38 **	0.26 **	0.15	0.19 **	0.14 *	0.51 *	0.33	-0.58	-0.56	-1.75 **	-1.96 **	-0.02 *	-0.02 ns	-1.46 **	-1.44	0.21 **	0.16 **	0.60 **	0.56 **
K0307X DBW321	0.58	-0.03	-2.01 **	-2.41 **	0.50 **	0.42 **	0.37 **	0.27 **	0.25 **	0.20 **	2.01 **	1.84 **	0.06	0.08	-0.34 **	-0.55 **	-0.02 *	-0.03	-0.52	-0.49	0.80 **	0.75 **	1.73 **	1.69 **
K1601XK1317	-0.81 *	-1.39 **	4.99 **	4.59 **	0.45 **	0.37 **	-0.09	-0.24 **	-0.04	-0.09	-1.29 **	-1.46 **	0.62	0.64	-0.61 **	-0.80 **	0	-0.01	1.43 **	1.45	-0.50 **	-0.55 **	0.73 **	0.68 **
K1601X H11563	0.3	-0.31	1.35 **	0.95 **	0.50 **	0.44 **	0.22 **	0.12	-0.05	-0.08	-0.78 **	-0.96 **	0.92 *	0.92	0.09	-0.11	0.03 *	0.03	0.62	0.62	-0.27 **	-0.32 **	1.43 **	1.40 **
K1601X DBW107	-1.98 **	-2.59 **	-0.16	-0.56	0.65 **	0.59 **	0.41 **	0.28 **	0.05	0.01	-2.54 **	-2.70 **	-0.88 *	-0.86	-3.02 **	-3.22 **	0.03 *	0.02	1.10 *	1.12	-0.04	-0.09 **	0.62 **	0.60 **
K1601XHD3059	-0.45	-1.03 *	1.06 **	0.66	0.78 **	0.72 **	0.41 **	0.31 **	-0.17 **	-0.22 **	-0.79 **	-0.96 **	1.09 **	1.11	-2.80 **	-3.00 **	0.07 **	0.07 **	1.54 **	1.56 *	0.28 **	0.23 **	0.11 *	0.05
K1601X DBW321	-1.42 **	-2.03 **	-3.18 **	-3.59 **	0.62 **	0.56 **	0.65 **	0.55 **	-0.21 **	-0.26 **	-0.49 *	-0.65 **	2.06 **	2.08 **	-1.79 **	-1.99 **	0.11 **	0.11 **	3.48 **	3.51 **	-0.15 **	-0.20 **	0.93 **	0.89 **
K1317X H11563	0.83 **	0.24	2.08 **	1.68 **	-0.07	-0.13 *	0.11	0.01	0.14 *	0.09	1.13 **	0.95 **	0.62	0.61	1.61 **	1.42 **	-0.02	-0.02	-0.21	-0.22	-0.01	-0.06	0.24 **	0.21 **
K1317X DBW107	0.55	-0.03	-0.96 **	-1.37 **	0.15 **	0.09	0.36 **	0.47 **	0.04	-0.02	-1.16 **	-1.32 **	-0.52	-0.5	-0.90 **	-1.09 **	0.03 *	0.05 **	-1.07 *	-1.05	0.17 **	0.12 **	-0.68 **	-0.80 **
K1317X HD3059	-1.59 **	-2.48 **	-1.84 **	-2.24 **	-0.32 **	-0.38 **	0.29 **	0.16	0.21 **	0.15 *	2.60 **	2.42 **	0.45	0.47	-1.34 **	-1.53 **	-0.02	-0.02	2.04 **	2.06 **	-0.11 **	-0.16 **	-0.25 **	-0.29 **
K1317X DBW321	-0.56	-1.14 **	0.41	0.01	-0.11 *	-0.17 **	0.60 **	0.48 **	0.04	-0.03	1.76 **	1.60 **	1.42 **	1.44 *	-0.40 **	-0.59 **	0.06 **	0.06 **	1.98 **	2.01 **	0.37 **	0.32 **	-0.36 **	-0.50 **
HI1563X DBW107	0.66 *	0.05	-0.47	-0.87 *	-0.03	-0.09	-0.26 ***	-0.37 **	-0.38 **	-0.52 **	-2.72 **	-2.89 **	-0.88 *	-0.89	-1.34 **	-1.53 **	0.05 **	0.08 **	-1.54 **	-1.55 *	0.68 **	0.63 **	-1.54 **	-1.55 **
HI1563X HD3059	-0.48	-1.06 *	0.32	-0.08	-0.50 **	-0.56 **	-0.59 **	-0.68 **	-0.20 **	-0.25 **	-0.57 **	-0.75 **	-0.91 *	-0.92	-1.65 **	-1.84 **	-0.02	-0.02	-0.43	-0.44	0.32 **	0.27 **	-1.65 **	-1.77 **
HI1563X DBW321	-4.12 **	-4.73 **	-0.26	-0.66	-0.36 **	-0.42 **	-0.05	-0.36 **	-0.41 **	-0.46 **	-1.73 **	-1.90 **	-2.27 **	-2.28 **	-0.70 **	-0.90 **	0.08 **	0.06 **	1.85 **	1.84 *	0.28 **	0.23 **	-1.59 **	-1.61 **
DBW107 X HD3059	-0.42	-1.01 *	1.01 **	0.61	-0.28 **	-0.34 **	-0.41 **	-0.66 **	0.20 **	0.14 *	2.67 **	2.51 **	-1.05 **	-1.03	2.91 **	2.71 **	-0.09 **	-0.10 **	-0.63	-0.61	-0.82 **	-0.87 **	0.23 **	0.21 **
DBW107 X DBW321	1.61 **	0.99 *	-1.24 **	-1.64 **	-0.71 **	-0.77 **	-0.29 **	-0.41 **	0.19 **	0.14 *	1.97 **	1.66 **	-1.41 **	-1.39 *	3.46 **	3.26 **	-0.07 **	-0.07 **	-3.02 **	-2.99 **	-0.15 **	-0.20 **	0.13 *	0.1
DH 3069 X DBW321	-0.53	-1.12 **	155**	1 15 **	-0.05	-0.11	-0 53 **	-0.62 **	-0.23 **	-0.29 **	-2.94 **	-3 10 **	1 90 **	1.92.**	2.71 **	2.51 **	0.01	0.02	2.43 **	2.45 **	0.76 **	071**	0.78 **	0.75 **

Characters/ Crosses	Days to 75% flowering	Plant height (cm)	No. of productive tillers/plant	No. of spikelets/spike	Spike length (cm)	No. of grain/spike	Days to maturity	Grain weight (g)	Ear density	Duration of reproductive	Protein content (%)	Grain yield/plant (g)
HD3249X DBW187	-6.93 **	3.53 **	8.25 **	-4.86 **	-7.44 **	-16.43 **	-0.53	1.24	2.41	16.67 **	-20.16 **	-39.65 **
HD3249X HD2967	-8.03 **	1.19	1.94	-1.71	-0.3	-15.24 **	0	-1.65	-1.68	21.57 **	-17.67 **	-37.33 **
HD3249X K0307	-8.03 **	-5.41 **	10.19 **	-6.86 **	-6.25 **	-12.62 **	-1.33	-1.49	-0.94	16.67 **	-15.89 **	-33.27 **
HD3249X K1601	-10.95 **	-0.45	13.59 **	-6.86 **	-3.57	-18.43 **	-4.26 **	-2.81 **	-3.74	13.73 *	-18.15 **	-35.01 **
HD3249X K1317	-6.20 **	-9.67 **	7.28 *	-6.00 **	-8.93 **	-16.31 **	-3.72 **	0.41	2.86	2.94	-16.77 **	-36.17 **
HD3249X HI1563	-12.77 **	-4.71 **	6.31 *	-8.57 **	-7.74 **	-17.98 **	-4.79 **	-2.48 *	-1.27	16.67 **	-15.89 **	-43.91 **
HD3249X DBW107	-7.30 **	-0.1	1.94	-8.86 **	-11.31 **	-11.31 **	-3.46 **	3.96 **	2.31	6.86	-19.78 **	-41.20 **
HD3249X HD3059	-6.57 **	-7.71 **	7.28 *	-6.57 **	-10.71 **	-22.62 **	-4.26 **	2.97 **	4.25	1.96	-19.90 **	-38.49 **
HD3249X DBW321	-5.11 **	3.39 **	3.4	-10.57 **	-14.29 **	-23.93 **	-4.52 **	1.24	3.88	-2.94	-21.41 **	-44.29 **
DBW187X HD2967	-0.36	2.44 *	16.99 **	-1.57	-6.25 **	-1.31	0	4.54 **	4.55 *	0.98	-10.13 **	-24.56 **
DBW187X K 0307	-0.36	-5.41 **	24.27 **	-7.00 **	-7.14 **	0	0.27	3.96 **	-0.19	1.96	-8.50 **	-25.92 **
DBW187X K 1601	-6.57 **	-0.8	27.67 **	-7.00 **	-7.14 **	-6.36 **	-3.99 **	2.56 *	-0.16	2.94	-11.88 **	-26.69 **
DBW187X K 1317	0	-9.67 **	16.02 **	-6.29 **	-8.63 **	-4.76 **	-4.26 **	5.61 **	2.22	-15.69 **	-9.63 **	-29.21 **
DBW187X H11563	-5.84 **	-4.99 **	16.99 **	-8.71 **	-5.65 **	-7.08 ***	-6.91 **	3.47 **	-3.65	-9.8	-7.17 **	-33.27 **
DBW187X DBW107	0	0.31	14.56 **	-9.00 **	-9.23 **	-2.98 *	-4.79 **	10.56 **	-0.13	-17.65 **	-12.26 **	-31.91 **
DBW187X HD3059	-0.73	-8.03 **	18.45 **	-6.71 **	-14.88 **	-7.86 **	-3.19 **	9.32 **	9.12 **	-9.8	-7.50 **	-28.05 **
DBW187X DBW321	0.36	0.77	15.53 **	-10.43 **	-18.15 **	-8.93 **	-1.06	5.28 **	9.00 **	-4.9	-13.76 **	-34.24 **
HD2967X K0307	0.36	-9.67 **	18.93 **	-4.43 **	1.79	2.98 *	-1.33	0.08	-6.43 **	-5.88	2.66 **	4.64 **
HD2967X K1601	-1.82	-4.29 **	22.33 **	-4.43 **	-0.6	-6.07 **	-5.32 **	-4.46 **	-4.21	-14.71 **	-0.85	2.13
HD2967X K1317	1.09	-9.25 **	5.34	-3.71 **	-2.98	-4.88 **	-3.72 **	0.5	-1.24	-16.67 **	1.15	0.77
HD2976X HI1563	-3.28 *	-4.36 **	5.34	-6.14 **	-2.98	-7.74 **	-7.71 **	-2.64 *	-3.53	-19.61 **	3.66 **	-1.74
HD2967X DBW107	-0.36	-2.44 *	0.97	-6.43 **	-7.14 **	-3.10 *	-7.45 **	5.28 **	0.45	-26.47 **	-0.85	0
HD2967X HD3059	-1.46	-11.90 **	3.4	-4.14 **	-9.52 **	-8.93 **	-3.72 **	4.54 **	5.53 *	-9.8	1.65	0.58
HD2967X DBW321	0	0.87	0	-7.86 **	-8.63 **	-9.64 **	-1.6	0.83	0.52	-5.88	-1.6	-2.71 *
K0307X K1601	-5.11 **	-10.65 **	43.69 **	-11.43 **	-2.38	-3.45 *	-2.93 **	-3.47 **	-9.60 **	2.94	5.92 **	-3.68 **
K0307X K1317	-2.19	-14.24 **	37.38 **	-8.43 **	-2.98	-1.9	-3.99 **	0.33	-5.97 **	-8.82	6.67 **	-5.03 **
K0307X H11563	-5.47 **	-15.11 **	32.04 **	-10.86 **	-6.55 **	-6.79 **	-7.45 **	-5.28 **	-4.98 *	-12.75 *	9.18 **	-7.16 **
K0307X DBW107	-3.28 *	-6.39 **	31.07 **	-11.71 **	-10.12 **	-2.14	-7.45 **	3.38 **	-2.17	-18.63 **	5.92 **	-6.19 **
K0307X HD3059	-2.55	-17.10 **	33.01 **	-10.57 **	-9.82 **	-7.74 **	-3.46 **	1.16	-1.17	-5.88	7.04 **	-5.42 **
K0307X DBW321	-0.73	-9.35 **	28.16 **	-13.43 **	-11.31 **	-6.31 **	-2.13	-0.33	-2.75	-5.88 ns	5.29 **	-6.19 **
K1601X K1317	-6.57 **	-2.65 *	38.35 **	-8.29 **	-5.95 **	-12.02 **	-4.26 **	-8.75 **	-2.78	1.96	-6.74 **	-9.09 **
K1601X H11563	-10.58 **	-4.89 **	37.38 **	-11.14 **	-7.44 **	-17.98 **	-7.45 **	-10.23 **	-4.37	0.98	-1.6	-13.35 **
K1601X DBW107	-8.03 **	-3.18 *	35.44 **	-10.29 **	-8.93 **	-13.81 **	-8.51 **	-5.78 **	-1.81	-9.8	-6.74 **	-11.80 **
K1601X HD3059	-8.39 **	-9.53 **	41.75 **	-9.67 **	-14.29 **	-19.29 **	-3.72 **	-8.09 **	5.04 *	8.82	-0.73	-11.99 **
K1601X DBW321	-7.30 **	-4.47 **	33.98 **	-12.00 **	-16.67 **	-20.00 **	-2.13	-10.56 **	5.20 *	11.76 *	-10.13 **	-14.51 **
K1317X H11563	-5.47 **	-9.01 **	8.74 **	-10.86 **	-7.44 **	-9.64 **	-7.18 **	1.65	-4.04	-11.76 *	3.91 **	-28.24 **
K1317X DBW107	-0.73	- 8.90 **	7.77 **	-9.71 **	-10.71 **	-6.43 **	-7.71 **	7.59 **	0.74	-26.47 **	-1.6	-27.27 **
K1317X HD3059	-5.11 **	-17.45 **	5.34	-9.43 **	-12.50 **	-8.33 **	-3.72 **	3.63 **	3.14	0	-0.1	-22.05 **
K1317X DBW321	-1.82	-5.58 **	2.91	-11.43 **	-16.07 **	-11.07 **	-2.13	0.99	5.18 *	-2.94	-2.61 **	-29.98 **
HI1563X DBW107	-5.84 **	-6.81 **	3.4	-16.57 **	-15.77 **	-16.07 **	-11.44 **	3.30 **	-1.27	-26.47 **	5.67 **	-40.62 **
H11563X HD3059	-9.12 **	-13.61 **	0.97	-17.43 **	-17.56 **	-20.83 **	-8.24 **	-0.33	-0.16	-5.88	6.54 **	-38.49 **
H11563X DBW321	-10.95 **	-4.71 **	-2.43	-18.43 **	-21.43 **	-24.17 **	-8.51 **	-2.97 **	3.45	-1.96	0.15	-45.45 **
DBW107 X HD3059	-4.01 **	-9.60 **	0	-16.57 **	-16.37 **	-7.74 **	-7.98 **	23.10 **	-0.67	-18.63 **	-8.87 **	-21.28 **
DBW107 X DBW321	0.36	-2.44 *	-11.65 **	-19.43 **	-18.45 **	-10.24 **	-7.45 **	19.47 **	-1.6	-28.43 **	-10.00 **	-29.21 **
DH3069 X DBW321	-4.01 **	-7.16 **	2.43	-19.86 **	-25.60 **	-27.62 **	-1.6	14.77 **	7.39 **	4.9	0.53	-22.63 **

Table 2. Estimation of heterosis over economic parent (HD 2967) for 12 characters in a 10 parent diallel cross in wheat

Considering simultaneously the per se performance and gca effects, good general combiners common in the F_1 and F_2 generations were K 0307, K 1601, K 1317 and HD 3059 for grain yield per plant (g). The consistency of aforesaid combiners for yield and quality contributing traits in both the generations indicated that good general combiners were stable in their performance over generation.

On the basis of overall performance, parents HD 2967, K 0307, K 1601, K 1317 and HD 3059 were observed best general combiners for grain yield and other important yield contributing characters as well as quality characters. These parents may be used for simultaneous improvement in grain yield and quality attributes through an inter-mating population involving all possible combinations among themselves.

The sca effects representing dominance and epistatic component of genetic variability would not contribute much for improvement of selfpollinated crops except where commercial exploitation of heterosis in feasible. The crosses involving good general combiners and showing high sca effects may be utilized for further breeding purposes. Desirable transgressive segregants are expected to be produced by making a large number of crosses. Khrostovska, [21], Jinks and Jones [22] also suggested that the superiority of many hybrids may not be indicated by their ability to produce transgressive segregants due to non-fixable gene action would be important for grain yield. In respect of grain yield per plant; the positive and significant values of sca were associated with five combinations with high mean per se performance like HI1563, HD2967X HD2976X DBW107. HD2967X DBW321, K 0307X HI 1563 and K 0307X DBW 321 were observed good specific combiner in F1 and five crosses, namely HD 2967X K 1317, HD 2976X HI 1563, HD 2967X DBW 321, K 0307X HI 1563 and K 0307X DBW 321 were observed good specific combiner in F₂

3.2 Heterosis

Heterosis is measured as the mean superiority of F_1 over economic parent; better parent is thus, an important parameter in such studies. Heterosis breeding has come to play a pivotal role in crop improvement programme for obtaining higher production. The first important step in the exploitation of heterosis is to know its magnitude and direction.

In better parent heterosis were ranged from -37.33 (HD3249X HD2967) to 4.64 (HD 2967X K

0307) per cent for grain yield per plant. The cross combinations, namely, HD2967X K0307 and K0307X K1601 with positive and significant values were in the order of merit for grain yield per plant, similar finding was observed by Ved et al. [23] and Sharma and Sain [24]. Economic heterosis ranged from -45.45 (HI 1563X DBW 321) to 4.64 (HD 2967X K 0307) per cent for grain yield per plant. The cross combination, viz., HD2967X K0307 with positive and significant values were in the order of merit for grain vield per plant. Similar result was observed by Singh et al. [25]. Considerable heterosis for grain yield over economic parent was reported by Salgotra (2002), Punia et al. [26], Kumar and Sharma [27], Singh et al. [28], Bio-Yin Guang et al. [29], Singh et al. [30].

4. CONCLUSION

The relative ranking of the parents on the basis of per se performance and gca effect in both the generations HD 3249 and HI 1563 for days to 75% flowering, HD 3059 and K 030 for plant height. K0307 and K 1601 for number of tillers per plant, HD 2967 for number of spikelets per spike and spike length, K 0307 and HD 2967 for number of grain per spike, HI 1563 and DBW 107 for days to maturity, DBW 107 and HD 3059 for 1000-seed weight, K 0307 for ear density, DBW 107 for duration of reproductive phase, K 0307 and HI 1563 for protein content and HD 2967and K 0307 foe yield per plant. These parents could be exploited further in breeding programme for simultaneously improved in grain yield and quality attributes. The sca effect for grain yield per plant was significant and considerable good specific combiner were four crosses in F1 and four crosses in F2 generations. These crosses had involved all the three possible combination between high and low gca effects. The cross combinations involving parents HD2967, K 0307, K 1601, and HD 3249 were expected to have fixable, additive or additive x additive gene effects.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This paper is extracted from thesis sub-mitted in fulfilment of Doctor of Philosophy in agriculture in Genetics and Plant Breeding at the CSA University of Agriculture and Technology, Kanpur (Uttar Pradesh)-208002, India.

COMPETING INTERESTS

Authors have declared that no competing interests exist.

REFERENCES

- 1. Harlan JR, Zohary D. Distribution of wild wheat and barley. Science. 1966;153 (3740):1074-80.
- FGH. History of wheat breeding. In: Lupton FGH, editor, Wheat breeding: its scientific basis. London, UK: Chapman & Hall. 1987;31-49.
- USDA. United States Department of Agriculture; 2021. Available:https://apps.fas.usda.gov/psclonli ne.
- 4. Hayman BI. The theory and analysis of diallel crosses. Genetics. 1954a;39(6):789-809.
- 5. Jinks JL. The F2 and backcross generations from a set of diallel crosses. Heredity. 1956;10(1):1-30.
- Hayman BI. The theory of analysis of diallel crosses-II. Genetics. 1958;43(1):63-85.
- Mather K, Jinks JL. Biometrical genetics. 2nd (Ed.) Chapman and Hall Ltd. London; 1971.
- Griffing B. Concept of general and specific combining ability in relation to diallel crossing system. Australian. J Biol Sci. 1956b;9:463-93.
- Tiwari V, Chakrabarty SK. Combining ability analysis for yield traits and harvest index in bread wheat. Proceedings of the natl symp.; recent adv genet plant breed; 1989. Res. In: Varanasi BHU, editor. India. Vol. 51:Abstr VI:.
- Ahmad Z, Srivastava JK. Partial diallel analysis for some quality and physiological traits related to productivity in wheat. Proceedings of the golden Jubilee symp.: Indian soc genet. Plant Breed, New Delhi. 1990:305:Abstr II.
- Sharma SK, Singh KP, Singh I. Selection responses for grain weight in some intermated populations of wheat (*Triticum aestivum* L.). Proceedings of the golden Jublee symp: Indian soc genet. Plant Breed, New Delhi. 1991:357:Abstr II.
- Singh T, Rai RK. Genetics of yield and some morphophysiological traits in bread wheat. Paper presented in golden Jubilee Symposium Indian Soc Genet P.I. Breed New Delhi Abstr. Vol. II; 1991. p. 357.
- Kulshrestha Vp, Chowdhary S, Jain KBL. Genetic nature of tillering in wheat. Proceedings of the golden Jubilee symp. Indian soc genet. Plant Breed, New Delhi. 1991:364:Abstr II.

- 14. Zalewski D. Estimation of general and specific combining ability of quantitative traits of winter wheat. Biul Inst Hodowli Aklimatyzacji Roslin. 2001;216(21).
- 15. Kumar A, Ram RB, Singh SP. Studies on yield and its component traits in bread wheat (*Triticum aestivum* L.). New Bot. 2002;XXIX:175-80.
- Srivastava A. Combining ability for grain yield and contributing traits in bread wheat. Farm J Sci. 2005;14(1):92-5.
- Rabbani G, Magmood A, Shabbir G, Shah KN, Naeem-ud-din. Gene action in some yield attributes of bread wheat under two water regimes. Pak J Bot. 2011;43(2):1141-56.
- Singh V, Krishna R, Singh S, Vikram P. Combining ability and heterosis analysis for yield traits in bread wheat (*Triticum aestivum*). Indian J Agric Sci. 2012;82(11):916-21.
- Samier K, Ismail A. Heterosis and combining ability analysis for yield and its components in bread wheat (*Triticum aestivum* L.). Int J Curr Microbiol Appl Sci. 2015;4(8):1-9.
- sum T, Kumar A, Prasad B. Study of Combining Ability and Nature of Gene Action for Yield and Its Contributing Traits in Bread Wheat (*Triticum aestivum* L. em Thell). Int J Curr Microbiol Appl Sci. 2017;6(10):3562-73.
- 21. Khrostovaka K 'ska, G. Transgression in peas. Plant Breed. 1975;50:1654:abstr 1980.
- 22. Jinks LL, Jones RM. Estimation of components of heterosis. Genetics. 1958;43:223-34.
- 23. Ved P, Saini DD, Pancholi SR. Genetic basis of heterosis for grain yield and its traits in wheat (*Triticum aestivum* L. em. Thell) under normal and late sown conditions. Crop Res. 2006;31(2):245-9.
- 24. Sharma SN, Sain RS. Estimation of components of heterosis for harvest index in durum wheat under normal and late plantings. Crop Improv. 2005;32(2):137-42.
- 25. Singh J, Garg DK, Raje RS. Combining ability and gene action for grain yield and its components under high temperature environment in bread wheat (*Triticum aestivum* L.em. Thell). Indian J Genet. 2007;67(2):193-5.
- 26. Punia SS, Shah MA, Mittal GK. Heterosis in bread wheat [*Triticum aestivum* (L.) Em. TheiL]. Indian J Genet Plant Breed. 2005;65(04):284-6.

Kumar et al.; IJPSS, 34(22): 1712-1722, 2022; Article no.IJPSS.91941

- 27. Kumar A, Sharma SC. Gene action and heterosis for some quantitative traits in bread wheat (*T. aestivum* L.) under different moisture conditions. Indian J Genet Plant Breed. 2005;65(4):284.
- Singh L, Singh P, Daya R, Singh B, Kumar J. Heterosis and inbreeding depression for yield components and quality parameters in wheat (*Triticum aestivum* L.). Progr Rese. 2008;3(2):157-9.
- 29. Guang Y-B.; Sen, Wang Xq,Wang; Yu-hail. Agric Sci China 8(6), L; Lin, Wang and Hong-gang. 2009. Heterosis and Combining Ability for Major Yield Traits of a New Wheat Germplasm Shannong 0095 Derived from Thinopyrum intermedium: 753-60.
- 30. Singh SV, Verma S, Tiwari LP, Singh SP. Heterosis in bread wheat (*Triticum aestivum* L.). Prog Res. 2009;4(1):103-5.

© 2022 Kumar et al.; This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

Peer-review history: The peer review history for this paper can be accessed here: https://www.sdiarticle5.com/review-history/91941